Family fun–family tragedy: ATV-related deaths involving family members

All-terrain vehicle (ATV) riding is a very popular recreational activity, which has experienced increased participation worldwide since the early 1990s. In the USA alone, the US Consumer Product Safety Commission (CPSC) estimates that nearly seven million four-wheel ATVs were in use in 2004 with some 23 million riders. A 2005 statewide random digit dial telephone survey of 1243 West Virginia households provided evidence that ATV riding is a very popular and family-based event in all regions of the state. With a population slightly less than two million, 30% of sampled households own an ATV, and an estimated 460 000 ATVs are in use throughout West Virginia.

As ATV riding has become an immensely popular family-oriented activity, the availability and use of ATVs has led to increased exposure to hazardous and unsafe conditions that have resulted in hundreds of deaths and thousands of injuries nationally. In fact, the estimated number of deaths associated with ATVs has risen nearly 180% from 276 deaths in 1995 to 767 in 2004 (the most recent year for which annual fatality data are available from the CPSC). Estimated non-fatal injuries requiring emergency room treatment rose over 150% from 53 600 visits in 1996 to 136 700 in 2005. West Virginia’s 138 deaths during the period 2002–2005 accounted for over 6% of all ATV-related deaths in the country—second only to Kentucky’s 143 deaths. This proportion and ranking will probably increase with the 52 deaths recorded in the state in 2006 and an additional 19 through May 2007.

Recreational riding often involves not only the driver/operator but passengers as well. There has been little attention directed towards passengers, however. A title and abstract review of over 120 ATV peer-review papers worldwide over the past two decades indicates that there have been no studies that have focused solely on passenger deaths and more specifically on family relationships between driver and passenger. A 2004 study by Aitken et al used youth and adult focus groups to gather information on riding with families, double riding, and safety behaviors. Efforts to improve safety awareness and practice among children were stressed.

A brief review of fatal ATV crashes in West Virginia between 2001 and mid-2007 found that 21% (48 of 225) of the crashes involved ATVs carrying passengers. Forty-six percent (22 of 48) of these victims were passengers; 57% of the victims were male with an average age of 33.0 years, and the remainder female with an average age of 21.3 years. Sixteen percent of these crashes involved alcohol. The proportion of passengers involved (21%) is slightly greater than the 18% noted by the CPSC in their 2001 technical review of National Electronic Injury Surveillance System data and the 17% of passenger cases identified in West-Central Illinois between 1994 and 2001. The objective of this study was to further review West Virginia’s ATV crashes involving passengers and determine family relationships (eg, father–son, grandmother–grandson, sister–sister, husband–wife) between the driver and passenger, and to estimate the economic burden of these deaths.

METHODS

The crash victim’s position on the ATV and any potential family relationships between the driver and passenger were determined through a review of a comprehensive database of West Virginia ATV deaths maintained by the author. Data were primarily derived from death certificates, with supplemental information provided from medical examiner reports, police reports, local media accounts, and CPSC investigation reports, when available. The Pacific Institute for Research and Evaluation provided cost estimates based on a human capital approach that incorporates medical, work loss (wages), and quality of life components. Estimates are presented in 2004 US dollars at West Virginia price levels.

RESULTS

From 2001 to mid-2007, 11 fatal ATV crashes involved various combinations of family relationships. The victims from these events accounted for 24% of the deaths in the 48 crashes where passengers were aboard. Seven of the 11 victims were male. The mean age of the victims was 28.3 years (range 5–73 years) with females slightly older than males: 31.8 and 26.3 years, respectively. Passengers were about 3 years older than drivers: 29.8 and 26.4 years, respectively. One of the crashes involved alcohol. Six (three male and three female) victims were passengers and five were drivers (four male and one female). The three youngest victims aged 5 (male), 8 (male), and 8 (female) years were all passengers.

Helmets were generally not worn by the victims; there was no requirement to do so until 2005 and then only for riders under 18 years of age. The passenger or driver not killed was slightly injured in six of the 11 fatal events. In one of the scenarios involving a grandparent and grandchild, the 6-year-old grandson was driving the ATV when his grandmother was thrown from the ATV during an out of control U-turn. Two of the nine crashes involved multiple passengers (ie, twin 5-year-old grandsons, and a young girl and her cousin). All of these crashes involved rollovers and flipping on embankments and inclines, or collisions with fixed objects such as trees and gates. Table 1 provides additional details about the fatal incidents.

Two other ATV crashes not detailed in table 1 involved family members but did not directly involve passengers. In the first, a 49-year-old helmeted female was riding with her husband (on a separate ATV) when she lost control, left the trail, and hit a tree. In the second, a 34-year-old non-helmeted male was hit from behind by another ATV driven by his brother who had his wife aboard as a passenger.

The estimated overall mean cost (in 2004 US dollars) for each of the 11 ATV-related fatalities described above was US$3.0 million; about 65% (US$1.96 million) of this cost was related to quality of life, 34% (US$1.03 million) to work and wages, and 1% (US$0.01 million) to medical services.

DISCUSSION

Since 1988, all ATVs manufactured in the USA have been voluntarily labeled with multiple safety warnings including not carrying passengers. The presence of just one passenger—whether situated behind the driver or in front of him or her (ie, on the driver’s lap or on the handlebars)—
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Total annual deaths</th>
<th>Month occurred</th>
<th>Gender, position on ATV, relation</th>
<th>Age of decedent</th>
<th>Crash event</th>
<th>Injury</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>July</td>
<td>Male, passenger, grandson</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>ATV went over embankment and flipped when ATV was put in reverse</td>
<td>Massive head injuries</td>
<td>No helmets; grandmother was driving ATV with twin 5-year-old grandsons as passengers. She and surviving grandson treated and released</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Male, passenger, grandfather</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>ATV plunged down a steep embankment on a private dirt road</td>
<td>Multiple trauma</td>
<td>Daughter was a passenger; 12-year-old grandson was the driver; he had little experience operating an ATV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>March</td>
<td>Female, driver, mother</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>ATV went off dirt road and hit tree</td>
<td>Massive head trauma</td>
<td>Passenger not helmeted. 6-year-old grandson driving ATV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Male, passenger, grandfather</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>ATV plunged down a steep embankment on a private dirt road</td>
<td>Multiple trauma</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>May</td>
<td>Female, passenger, grandmother</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>ATV went out of control in U-turn causing victim to fall and hit head on pavement</td>
<td>Closed head injury</td>
<td>Father was driving ATV; no helmets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Male, passenger, son</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3-wheeled ATV struck steel gate at cemetery entrance</td>
<td>Blunt head trauma</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>June</td>
<td>Female, passenger, sister</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>ATV went out of control on a road curve and rolled over</td>
<td>Multiple head and chest injuries</td>
<td>No helmets; 14-year-old sister was the driver, slightly injured. Sisters were visiting their mother</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>May</td>
<td>Male, driver, grandson</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>ATV went into ditch causing passenger to fall off; ATV came out of ditch and flipped over on driver</td>
<td>Crushing force trauma</td>
<td>No helmets; grandfather was passenger</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>September</td>
<td>Male, driver, brother</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>ATV left road and hit tree</td>
<td>Blunt trauma</td>
<td>Husband was driver and also injured</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>August</td>
<td>Male, driver, brother</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>ATV went out of control on rural road</td>
<td>Traumatic brain injury</td>
<td>Driver and passenger not helmeted. Brother riding as passenger</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>August</td>
<td>Male, driver, father, uncle</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>ATV flipped backwards on a steep hill</td>
<td>Multiple</td>
<td>Driver not helmeted; daughter and nephew riding as passengers treated and released</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007*</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>May</td>
<td>Male, driver, brother</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>ATV hit utility pole at high speed doing “wheelie”</td>
<td>Multiple</td>
<td>No helmets. Younger brother was passenger and was slightly injured</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

suggests that driver/passenger status does
braking.10 The presence of passengers can
and have the ability to make quick body
ability of the ATV, especially one built for
impairs the safe operation and maneuver-
the economic costs associated with
these deaths is US$3 million for
each fatality, but the longer-term
psychological impact on families is
Further consideration should be
given to restricting the use of ATVs by
children, with potential caveats for
demonstrating appropriate
These deaths have been quantified and
categorized, the hidden societal costs
and the psychological devastation of
families when one member dies in
the presence of another are overwhelming
and incalculable. Certainly, there are far
more healthy and safer family-oriented
outdoor activities such as hiking and
bicycling, which could help to combat
obesity and sedentary lifestyles among
children and youth, a growing public
health concern worldwide.

It is good for families to recreate and
play together, but it is not safe to do so on
the same ATV, especially those not
designed to carry passengers. To ensure
a fun and safe family experience, parents
and other adults must supervise children,
use common sense, and lead by example.
If care givers are going to allow their
children to operate an ATV, they must
understand and explain the risks asso-
ciated with them. If children and youth
are operating an ATV on their own,
parents must know where and how they are
riding and encourage safe riding
practices (ie, no passengers, wearing a
helmet, not on a paved surface, and
following manufacturer’s guidelines
including the operation of age-appropri-
ate sized youth models).

Acknowledgements
This work was funded by a grant from (5 R49
CE000345) the National Center for Injury
Prevention and Control, Centers for Disease
Control and Prevention, Atlanta, Georgia.
Bruce Lawrence from the Pacific Institute for
Research and Evaluation provided assistance
on the economic cost analyses. Suzanne
Marsh’s review and comments on early drafts
and revisions are much appreciated.

James C Helmkamp,
Injury Control Research Center and Department
Illinois, Pediatr Emerg Care 2006;22:719–24; Virginia
University, PO Box 9151, Morgantown, WV
26506, USA; jhelmkamp@hsct.vww.edu

Key points
• Family members, as either the
driver or passenger, were involved in
nearly one-quarter of AV crashes in West Virginia from
2001 to mid 2007, where there
were passengers riding the ATV.
• Parents, or other responsible adults, are the key to safe, family-oriented
ATV riding; adults must act responsi-
• The economic costs associated with
these deaths is US$3 million for
each fatality, but the longer-term
psychological impact on families is
incalculable.

Parents, or other responsible adults,
are the key to safe, family-oriented
ATV riding; adults must act respon-
sibly by following the manufac-
turer’s safety guidelines and
through the use of safe riding
techniques.

Impairs the safe operation and maneuver-
ability of the ATV, especially one built for
only one rider. To safely steer and control
the ATV, the driver must be “rider active”
and have the ability to make quick body
shifts combined with acceleration and
braking.10 The presence of passengers can
easily and very quickly upset the delicate
balance and control that the ATV driver
must maintain, whether the ATV is
operated in the USA or any other country.
Historical review of West Virginia fatal-
ties involving passengers from 1990
forward has shown that the dynamics of
the crash event often differs between the
driver and passenger resulting in different
types of injuries and survival. Rodgers10
suggests that driver/passenger status does
not affect fatality risk to any significant
degree.
The operation of ATVs by young chil-
dren exacerbates the passenger/driver issue. In the 11 cases presented in this
brief report, four of the drivers were 6, 12,
and 14 (two) years of age. Children this
age often do not possess the physical size,
strength, coordination, and maturity to
safely operate an ATV, particularly adult-
sized ATVs, which can weigh over 500
pounds and attain speeds in excess of 50
mph.12 Youth often do not physically fit
the adult-size ATVs they operate; arm
length to reach grip throttles and leg
length and foot size for breaking and
shifting are often compromised.12
A number of consumer groups and
professional medical organizations,
including the Consumer Federation of
America, the American Academy of
Orthopaedic Surgeons (AAOS) and the
American Academy of Pediatrics (AAP),
have long advocated that passengers not
be allowed on ATVs.13–15 Model legislation
proposed by both the AAOS and the AAP
recommends the prohibition of passen-
gers and the use of ATVs for all children
younger than 16 years of age.14 15 The data
presented here strongly support this
recommendation and debunk continual
industry attempts to portray ATV riding
as legitimate and safe family-oriented
fun.

Although the economic costs associated
with these deaths have been quantified and
categorized, the hidden societal costs and
the psychological devastation of
families when one member dies in
the presence of another are overwhelming
and incalculable. Certainly, there are far
more healthy and safer family-oriented
outdoor activities such as hiking and
bicycling, which could help to combat
obesity and sedentary lifestyles among
children and youth, a growing public
health concern worldwide.

It is good for families to recreate and
play together, but it is not safe to do so on
the same ATV, especially those not
designed to carry passengers. To ensure
a fun and safe family experience, parents
and other adults must supervise children,
use common sense, and lead by example.
If care givers are going to allow their
children to operate an ATV, they must
understand and explain the risks asso-
ciated with them. If children and youth
are operating an ATV on their own,
parents must know where and how they are
riding and encourage safe riding
practices (ie, no passengers, wearing a
helmet, not on a paved surface, and
following manufacturer’s guidelines
including the operation of age-appropri-
ate sized youth models).

References
1 Ingle RL. 2005 annual report of ATV deaths and
injuries. Directorate for Epidemiology, US
Consumer Product Safety Commission,
Washington, DC. http://www.cpsc.gov/
stats.html [accessed 30 Jul 2007].
2 Althouse R, Kirby J, Helmkamp J. The public’s
knowledge and opinion about West Virginia’s
2004 all-terrain vehicle safety law. Poster presented
at 2006 Congress of Epidemiology. Am J Epidemiol
2006;163(Supp):S208/831.
All-terrain vehicle injury in children: strategies for
4 Levenson MS. All-terrain vehicle 2001 injury
study and exposure studies. Bethesda, MD: Directorate of
Epidemiology, US Consumer Product Safety
5 Nelson TA, Hafner JW. Emergency department
pediatric all-terrain vehicle injuries in West Central
6 Helmkamp JC, Lawrence BA. The economic burden
of all-terrain vehicle-related pediatric deaths in the
7 Helmkamp JC. A more effective prescription for
8 West Virginia Code. Chapter 17F, All-terrain
9 US District Court for the District of Columbia.
1988. United States of America v American Honda
Court for the District of Columbia, 1992; civil action
no 87–1, 3525.
10 Helmkamp JC, O’Hara FJ, David J. All-terrain
11 Rodgers GB. The effectiveness of helmets in
reducing all-terrain vehicle injuries and death.
12 Helmkamp JC. Adolescent all-terrain vehicle deaths
13 Consumer Federation of America. ATV safety
commission: America’s children at risk. CFA, Washington,
pdfs_Final_ATVReportLinks.pdf [accessed 30 Jul 2007].
14 American Academy of Orthopaedic Surgeons.
Position statement on all-terrain vehicles, revised
position/1101.asp [accessed 30 Jul 2007].
15 American Academy of Pediatrics. All-terrain
vehicle injury prevention: Two-, three-, and four
wheeled unlicensed motor vehicles. Pediatrics
Family fun–family tragedy: ATV-related deaths involving family members

James C Helmkamp

doi: 10.1136/ip.2007.016030

Updated information and services can be found at:
http://injuryprevention.bmj.com/content/13/6/426

These include:

**References**
This article cites 9 articles, 3 of which you can access for free at:
http://injuryprevention.bmj.com/content/13/6/426#BIBL

**Email alerting service**
Receive free email alerts when new articles cite this article. Sign up in the box at the top right corner of the online article.

**Topic Collections**
Articles on similar topics can be found in the following collections

- IP Cochrane corners (27)

**Notes**

To request permissions go to:
http://group.bmj.com/group/rights-licensing/permissions

To order reprints go to:
http://journals.bmj.com/cgi/reprintform

To subscribe to BMJ go to:
http://group.bmj.com/subscribe/